



WRITTEN SUBMISSION TO

THE INDEPENDENT WELSH PAY REVIEW BODY

Jan 2021

Community Union Voice Section  
Cymru Wales

T: 01332 372 337  
<https://community-tu.org>

## Contents

<b>Introduction</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Background</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Recruitment and retention Graduate labour market</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Recruitment: Initial Teacher Education</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Recruitment and retention in the profession</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>Vacancies, applications and future demand</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Matter for recommendation</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>Comparison experienced teachers and And other graduate professions</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>Lead practitioners National scale TLRs</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>Workload and time management</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>Pay Portability</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>Summary of responses</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>References</b>	<b>23</b>

## Introduction

*“Ongoing pay restraint is continuing to fail in incentivising high calibre excellent and experienced teachers to remain in the profession. Pay is a key and often a determining factor in retention of experienced teachers, when weighed against other more attractive opportunities and the huge workload teachers experience.*

*Schools and teachers are particularly facing the impact of the Covid 19 crisis, as well as implementing a new approach to assessment, and a new transformational curriculum for Wales.*

*In this demanding climate we need to be taking advantage of all levers and tools possible to secure a stable, supportive, and collegiate profession, enabled to deliver the quality teaching needed to recover from the crisis, and provide the supportive learning environment our school children and young people need. With these demands in mind Voice urgently calls for a pay increase of no less than 2.7% across the board, immediate steps to address the main driver of attrition named by teachers leaving the profession as an increasing and unsustainable workload by increasing the PPA from 10% to 20%. Given the challenges facing education in post Covid 19 recovery what we need is a decision making which sustains the teaching profession, not a yoyo response to budget pressures creating fractures within the school environments.”*

Deborah Lawson, January 2021

1. Voice Section of Community Union (hereafter Voice) is the union for education professionals. We are an independent trade union that represents teachers, lecturers, school support staff and childcare professionals.
2. We are committed to working productively with the IWPRB, the Welsh Government and with other stakeholders on matters relating to teachers’ pay and conditions. Therefore, we welcome the opportunity to submit written evidence to the Independent Welsh Pay Review Body (“IWPRB”) in the third year since teachers’ pay and conditions have been devolved to Wales, in response to the remit from the Cabinet Minister for Education to the IWPRB dated October 2020 (“the Remit”).
3. In submitting evidence, we agree with the IWPRB that, “[The] desire for co-operation and co-construction is a critical factor as educational professions and associated organisations seek collectively to improve educational standards and raise the status of the teaching profession in Wales”, and we continue to welcome the Cabinet Minister’s commitment to the principle of ‘no detriment’ for teachers in Wales. We note that the Chancellor UK has now proposed a pay freeze for education in England, a delay of the £30,000 starting salary for NQTs to 2023/24 and hope that the needs for Wales will be assessed on the evidence for Wales, and that this England position will not lead to a disadvantageous barrier to the Welsh teaching profession. It is imperative that measures are taken to provide for a resilient, secure and stable teaching professions for Wales. This would include an award of a pay increase particularly for the experienced teachers who take on a

much-increased level of responsibility, with an increased workload. Lack of recognition of their crucial role will lead to an increased sense of not being valued.

## **Background**

### **Current climate**

4. Voice welcomes the comments from the Minister for Education, where she has noted the impact on our children of the Covid 19 crisis. In the Welsh Agenda (IWA Publication Autumn/Winter 2020 (1)). She focussed on the need to plan for their futures by citing health professionals in Wales who 'pointed to the collateral damage children had suffered since lockdown, with more referrals for children experiencing mental health and eating disorders, and fewer children being seen for safeguarding assessments.' The Minister also highlighted the disproportionate impact of lockdown on those disadvantaged children who 'could have fallen up to 75% behind their more affluent peers' (The Welsh Agenda IWA Publication Autumn/Winter 2020). This impact requires a response from the Welsh Government which supports our dedicated teachers to work to the highest standards in repairing this damage.
5. In support of the above an analysis by the Education Endowment Foundation (EEF (2)) has suggested that a decade of progress in narrowing the attainment gap between disadvantaged pupils and their classmates in England (which was already known to be smaller than that in Wales) is likely to be have been reversed due to the Covid 19 pandemic. The Minister explained that this impact justifies 'talk of a lost generation (and) appears entirely legitimate', and the Minister has clarified her intent of doing everything in her power to negate the devastating impact of Covid 19 pandemic on our children and young people. In this article the Minister explains that the Welsh Government has made the financial commitment to try and bolster individual school budgets so that they can employ additional staffing required to help them identify and support children for whom the impact will have been greatest' (The Welsh Agenda 2020 (1)). The focus will be on both those children from more socio-economic deprived backgrounds and those facing public assessments in 2021. Voice welcomes this commitment from the Minister and hopes this will translate into a properly funded education system for Wales.
6. The PISA published scores of 2019 (3) demonstrated a statistical attainment improvement in maths, science and reading. Voice believes we must protect this improvement after years of harsh reporting for Wales. The trauma and emotional impact of the pandemic on our school children and young people will need further support from teachers to ensure a successful transition in overcoming this trauma. We need a resilient, secure and stable teaching profession to achieve this in line with Welsh Government's identification of improvement in education as a national mission.
7. The economic impact of the pandemic will affect everyone, but we know some are more affected than others and the low paid are particularly hit by Covid 19. OECD 2020 (4) has predicted that the global economy will gain momentum over the

coming two years, with global GDP at pre-pandemic levels by the end of 2021. After a sharp decline this year (- 6%), global GDP is projected to rise by just over 4% in 2021, and by a further 3¾ per cent in 2022. In the immediate future, although disadvantaged students have had the hardest time adjusting to distance learning, spending on education may be under threat in this coming year. Emergency public funds may be directed to public health and social welfare, and long-term public spending on education may be at risk. Since compensation and working conditions are important for attracting, developing and retaining high-quality skilled teachers and headteachers, it is important for policy makers to carefully consider teachers' salaries and career prospects as they try to secure both high quality teaching and education budgets (OECD 2020 (4)). Voice advocates for a policy direction supporting a resilient, stable and secure teaching profession.

8. Voice, whilst acknowledging the pressure on budgets, recognises it is most important for the future of our school children and the nation, that the pivotal role of education in economic recovery is kept as a priority in financial decision making as we go ahead. Human capital plays a central role in a country's economic development. Education is a pre-condition of economic growth, ignoring this would endanger the prosperity of future generations with widespread repercussions for poverty, social exclusion and sustainability of social security systems (Woessman 2015 (5)). Luke Sibieta (2020 (6)) has acknowledged 'the profound implications for school resources and spending,' from the pandemic, which includes long run consequences for educational inequalities.
9. UNESCO 2012 (8) identified that for every £1 spent on education, £10 to £15 can be generated in economic growth. Keeping education, a priority for the nation is vital in a post pandemic recovery plan. But this is not about 'merely years of schooling but the quality of teaching (reflected in international examinations) that has a significant relationship with economic growth'. (Hanushek et al 2010 (9)). Voice would strongly support this emphasis on the quality of teaching which stems from the intrinsic values which draw and retain people in the profession: the sense of making a difference, of holding professional pride, of belonging to a community and working collegially. These values embed a belonging which build resilience, stability, and a future security in our education profession (Chiong, C 2020 (10)).
10. Given the strategic importance of education to economic recovery Voice was disappointed that the IWPRB did not accept our demand for an across-the-board pay rise for all teachers and leaders of 5% for the 20/21 pay award. We were disappointed that the Cabinet Minister proposed a 3.1% overall pay rise which, although higher than the IWPRB's overall recommendation, did not compensate for the years of cuts to teachers' pay. Whilst we acknowledge that there have been serious issues regarding the recruitment and retention of graduates and early years teachers which need continued protection, we are concerned that the IWPRB recommendations led to an erosion of differentials within and between pay ranges due to this targeted award at the minimum MPR. Voice would advocate for no further erosion of these differentials, it is a key element in retention of our experienced teachers to maintain this, and short of restoring the previous distinctions Voice would draw attention to the balance of addressing the spoken of more time and a reduced workload.

11. Voice believes retention of experienced teachers in lead practitioner and leadership roles is crucial for that maintenance of a supportive culture which embeds NQTs in the school community. A strong school professional network and culture enhances the likelihood of NQTs staying in the profession beyond the 0-5 years of high risk of attrition. The lack of demonstration of value for this experienced teacher group is an oversight which fails to recognise the pivotal role the experienced teacher plays in retaining NQTs and early career teachers.
12. This group of teachers also create the most impact on learner development especially for those pupils experiencing disadvantage. We believe that the increasing reduction in differentials within and between pay ranges indicates that more senior teachers and senior leaders will not feel valued in the essential role that they play in the education system in Wales, and that this may lead to further disincentives for teachers to progress to senior leadership roles. This is already a matter of concern and is going to get worse unless senior teachers and senior leaders receive proper and proportionate pay increases. It is also worth noting that the future experienced teachers are our current NQTs, if we can retain them, a fractured pay scale does little to incentivise experienced teachers to remain in the profession.
13. Although the IWPRB acknowledged that workload is affecting the recruitment and retention of teachers and leaders, we would have liked to see more concrete recommendations requiring ascertainable outputs in the reduction of workload and bureaucracy by the end of the next academic year, particularly in the current COVID 19 contexts. As this reduction goes straight to the heart of developing resilience in our teaching profession.
14. We are pleased to see that the Welsh Government did re-introduce meetings for the Reducing Workload and Bureaucracy Working Group, which has been meeting since March. This group has produced a Charter on Wellbeing and Workload and has set up task and finish groups of practitioners to make recommendations on actions to address workload and bureaucracy. We are still at stage of recruiting practitioners to these task and finish groups. This is difficult due to the workload pressures practitioners hold.

We will continue to play our part along with other stakeholders in working with the Welsh Government to attempt to achieve real change in this area.

15. We cited evidence to the IWPRB regarding the lower proportion of women in leadership positions compared to the general teaching workforce, and evidence showing that the gender pay gap in education is significantly worse than the average gender pay gap. Therefore, we were pleased that the IWPRB referred to this in their response.
16. It is noted that the issue of how TLRs are implemented across and within schools is problematic, and we would like to remind the IWPRB that our comments on this aspect last year were that in areas where discretion has play, a gender imbalance can occur. In support of the IWPRB comments to Local Authorities on the need for gender monitoring in terms of appointments we would extend this further to ask for Equality Impact Assessments to be carried out on pay policies to assess for impact

on gender discrimination, and for other protected characteristics - this would include the current provision of supply teachers via private agencies.

17. The IWPRB itself has said (37), “We are concerned...about the recruitment of teachers and leaders generally and in particular the recruitment and retention of teachers in certain subjects.” Luke Sibieta (6) identified the long run consequences for educational equality and also referred to the need to use equality impact assessments on schools and using this to address both existing inequalities and those additional ones from the pandemic. Voice would support this as likely to identify inequality impacts beyond the criteria of the PDG, e.g., to include working poor. This need of schools challenged by local socio-economic circumstances, if identified and addressed by targeted funding, is an influencer on retention.
18. We also make the point that both the employers and unions were and are against the inclusion of any cost or affordability-based considerations and that a cost consideration has been included only due to the will of the Welsh Government. Therefore, we encourage the IWPRB to make its recommendations this year on the basis of the written and oral evidence presented to it, and not in response to considerations that remain within solely the power of the Welsh Government.
19. Despite the last recommended pay award, the full benefits of which were denied to more experienced teachers and school leaders, teaching salaries in Wales still lag behind those available elsewhere. We know that teachers are not entirely motivated by financial reward but, in the current context, low salary and uncertain progression do not help. It is important to note that where our experienced teachers are now, is that future progression for the NQTs who are now benefiting from the recent uplift. Luke Sibieta’s (6) review of school funding in response to Recommendation 1 of the Children & Young People’s Committee July 2019 Report on Schools Funding in Wales.

October 2020 has revealed a chronic under-funding of education in Wales. There has been a 6% fall in spending per learner since 2009/10. The recommendations include a move away from adopting a single minimum cost approach for use in spending decisions, to an approach of decision making on the basis of the evidence of the effects of school spending.

20. A 10% increase leads to an average improvement in outcomes of 7-10%, with larger effects for the more disadvantaged pupils. He further recommends extra funding for more deprived schools, as well for those with sixth forms. In reference to teachers pay, the main driver of costs in schools, his analysis shows that if Wales followed the English approach of committing to increase starting salaries to £30,000 (now planned for 2023/24), then school costs would be expected to grow by 4% 2019/20 to 2022/23 (on the assumption that other pay grows at 3%) or about 6% (on the assumption that other pay grows at 2%). This provides an indication of the likely amount school funding per learner will need to grow by to prevent real term cuts to resources.

Voice therefore calls on the IWPRB to:

- Make its recommendations on the basis of evidence rather than in response to Welsh Government requirements regarding cost.
- Recommend an across the board increase of at least 2.7% to prevent any further fall back in real terms pay (RPI 2021 is estimated to be 2.7% for 2021 (Bank of England (7))).
- Recommend that this increase is fully funded by the Welsh Government.
- Ensure that the pay framework provides a clear career pathway, meets current challenges and provides an attractive offer for teachers at all career stages, thereby fulfilling the Minister's previous commitment to increasing the number of teachers in Wales.
- Recommend that the PPA is increased from 10% to 20% and identify other avenues of creating slack in the system to support resilience and address workload issues.
- Seek to establish sustainable and appropriate pay levels in the long term, more attuned to supporting a resilient, stable and secure teaching profession, able to support the economic recovery required. Future pay awards should not erode the pay differentials, and the recommend research projects named at the end of this submission should be used to explore the possibly discriminatory use of TLRs and supply provision via agencies.
- Work to ensure that teaching re-claims its place in today's graduate job market.

*This section will address the push and pull of pressures on teachers and headteachers to remain in the profession, addressing perceived 'unfairness':*

- a) In comparison with other graduate salaries on retention generally.
- b) Impact of compressed pay ranges on retention of experienced teachers and headteachers.
- c) The use of incentive, differentials and TLRs and impact on retention.
- d) Working conditions including workload as a driver for attrition.

A central theme is that perception of fairness is comprised both of teachers intrinsic and extrinsic evaluation of compensation and working conditions, but also of lack of clarity on the basis of award of discretion/differentials, including TLRs, and movement from the MPS to the UPS.

## **Recruitment and Retention**

### **The Graduate Labour Market**

21. The following information and analysis refer to the most recent available data that Voice had been able to obtain when this submission was drafted. The economic impact of the pandemic will affect everyone, but we know some are more affected than others and the low paid are particularly hit by Covid 19. OECD has predicted that the global economy will gain momentum over the coming two years, with global GDP at pre-pandemic levels by the end of 2021. After a sharp decline this year (6%), global GDP is projected to rise by just over 4% in 2021, and by a further 3¾

% in 2022 (OECD (4).

22. As previously mentioned, given that education is at the root of economic recovery it is vital that we ensure Wales has a resilient, stable and secure teaching profession able to provide the support our school children and young people need on transition back to the school environment. Teachers still need to be recruited and retained, even at the current time, and even if the economy is severely affected over the next decade, and perhaps longer than that. It is as vital as ever that teachers' pay and conditions properly value and respect their work as professionals.
23. Therefore, Voice asserts, the Welsh Government has an imperative to ensure that sufficient teachers are recruited and retained in Wales in order for the new curriculum to be successfully implemented and for standards to be as high as possible. It is clear from evidence from a range of sources that there is a need to address a fractured recruitment highlighted by the number of decreasing applications per post which needs to be addressed immediately. We do not have enough information on the status of current applications.
24. Wales saw the largest increase in joblessness out of the whole of the UK, with a jump to 4.6%. The figures from the Office for National Statistics show that between July and September 2020, unemployment in Wales grew by 1.9% when compared to the previous quarter (11).
25. With regard to graduate employment, 2019/20, UK data from the research organisation, Luminate 8<sup>th</sup> Dec 2020(12) (part of the Higher Education Careers Service Unit), reveals a graduate labour market affected by the pandemic. They project the economic recovery to be normal by 2022/23, which means one more cycle of reduced graduation recruitment. The level of vacancies is running at 2/3<sup>rd</sup> the normal rate. The proportion of the workforce on furlough went up to 15.1%, with 30% of the workforce working remotely. Jobs adverts are at 77% of the level of the previous year. Health and Social care are at 90% of the same month last year, and education are at 60% of the same month last year. The pandemic caused economic disruption and scale back in recruitment generally. This year has seen the largest decrease in recruitment since the 2009 banking crisis from which it took 5 years to recover. The year-on-year entry drop to teaching has been 10.8%. The largest individual recruiter of 2019/20 was Teach First who had annual intake of over 1600 UK, (but who also have the highest turnover). This reduction of other current graduate recruitment in 2020 may provide a recruitment window for the education sector which we need to utilise in preparation for the challenges ahead.
26. According to Statistics for Wales (11) the largest shortfall was in recruiting potential secondary school teachers. A target of 851 students had been set for the sector, but just 480 enrolled for the 2018-19 academic year - a shortfall of 44%. The recruitment rate was down a further 9% on the previous year 2017-18.
27. In 2019/20 regional Wales-specific data from Luminate (12) shows that there has been a 3.8% increase in the number of graduates in professional-level jobs since 2015/16, and those domiciled in South Wales were slightly more likely to obtain professional-level employment than elsewhere. Education is one of the biggest industries in the country, second only to Health, employing 12.7% of graduates,

with only a small year-on-year decline of 1.9%, although it must be borne-in-mind that the population of Wales is increasing year-on-year at the same time. In 2020 the population increased to 3,230,500 (estimate May 2020). The decline in those employed in education and a rise in the population can only increase the need for teachers in Wales over the coming years.

28. Further graduates in Wales tend to gravitate towards the larger cities, predominantly in the South of the country. The most popular locations include Cardiff (26.8%) Swansea (8%) and Newport (9.8%) (13). The outlook for 20/21 is of continuing uncertainty for employers and the wider market vacancies are likely to fall by a further 2.9%.
29. Graduate starting salaries at the UK's leading graduate employers are expected to remain unchanged at a median average of £30,000 for the sixth consecutive year but with 15% of places in the top graduate employers now providing starting salaries of more than £45,000, this is significantly in excess of the starting salary for teachers. Graduate salary levels from 2005/2007 rose by 2.3% and 3.0% annually which was marginally higher than the inflation rate. 2008 saw a rise of 4.8%, and for 2009 was 5.9% from 2010 - the starting salary has been £29,000 to £30,000 – almost static.
30. In fact, an analysis of graduate salaries in 2020, by industry or business sector, shows that the public sector offers amongst the lowest of median graduate starting salaries at £24,200. Wales education is slightly higher at the current minima of the main pay range, (which is £27,018) and significantly lower than the median average for all sectors. We also note that graduates in Wales receive the lowest average starting salary at £20,600 (although male graduates earn more than their female counterparts at £21,395 to £20,144 respectively. Although it could then be argued that a teacher's starting salary in Wales compares favourably to this, we are still failing to recruit in sufficient numbers. This probably reflects on other concerns of teachers regarding the status of the profession, career progression, workload, and work life balance - a point to which we will be returning later. The starting salary is still below graduate wage average of £30,000, a continued barrier to ITE recruitment.
31. Providing the funding is made from Welsh Government, this could well be an ideal opportunity to recruit the needed professionals to education; to support our school children and young people and providing a long-term resource for the country on which economic recovery can be well based. If the economy bounces back as predicted by 2024, this opportunity will be changed as this current advantage will no longer operate. Teacher recruitment difficulties are even more marked in the West and North of Wales, particularly in rural areas, and for Welsh medium schools. In this context, it is even more vital that graduates perceive a career in teaching to provide attractive working conditions, alongside appropriate and commensurate remuneration. Voice believes a teaching profession which is resilient, stable and secure is one which can address recruitment problems before these areas of pressure are further exacerbated.

## Recruitment to Initial Teacher Education

32. The Welsh Government's national workforce development plan 2019 - 2021 states that, 'we recognise the importance of ensuring that teaching as a profession is well promoted and seen as an attractive proposition in the competitive field of graduate recruitment'.<sup>16</sup> However, both the numbers of those entering and completing Initial Teacher Education ('ITE') and those continuing in the profession through their careers show significant declines over the past 20 years.
33. With regard to the numbers of ITE students, The Welsh Government's Teachers' Planning Supply Model sets a cap on numbers to recruit to Initial Teacher Education courses. These targets are based on school sector and on postgraduate or undergraduate courses. Statistics released by the Education Workforce Council Wales May 2020 continue to cause concern. The number passing ITE have been reducing since 2003 at 2251, for 2020 this figure stands at 975. Whilst the EWCW comments that there is no crisis in teacher recruitment and retention, but some concern for the middle phase of experienced teachers (14), significantly the Nuffield Foundation (14) notes that 'the Welsh school system faces a substantial and growing challenge for ensuring there are sufficient teachers. The recruitment and retention challenge are most acute in the secondary schools....'The number of secondary school trainee teachers have been reducing year on year with an increasing below target recruitment to ITE since 2013/14. This is against a backdrop of rising pupil teacher ratio, and an expected bulge in pupil number in 2024. (15). For primary schools ITE recruitment has been below target since 2015/16. Across schools in Wales current 2020 pupil teacher ratios are 19.3, an increase from 18.4 in 2015.
34. Whilst the number of students able to speak Welsh is rising 23.4% in 2016 and now 34.6% in 2020 (13) the number s of teachers able to teach through the medium of Welsh remains static at 27.2% for 2019 and 2020 (EWC (14)).
35. It should also be remembered that a certain number of students fail to complete the ITE course because they have failed or withdrawn from the course (11.3% in 2018-2019, and 9.0% 2019-2020).<sup>19</sup> Taking this into account, the Education Workforce Council's ("EWC" (14) ) ITE Student Results 2019-2020 shows that the number of students successfully completing Initial Teacher Education in Wales has fallen by roughly 1,200 students in sixteen years, (from 2251 in 2002- 2003 to 975 in 2019 to 2020). Further, a proportion of students decide not to continue with teaching as a career even after successfully completing ITE. This is a worrying decline in those students completing ITE who then are able to, and choose to, progress to become NQTs.
36. Paras 33-36 here highlight that teaching as a profession is failing to recruit. In terms of attractiveness of the profession, a below average starting graduate salary, and the known pressured workload will have a detrimental impact (Egan et al (17)).

## Recruitment and Retention in the Profession.

37. Voice has always emphasised the importance of retaining the existing workforce in addition to attracting new recruits, including those in the first five years of their careers. The EWC Statistics Digest 2020 (the most recent data) shows that there has been a decrease in teacher numbers in Wales (14).  
The number of registered schoolteachers has declined year on year since 2010 with a 9.6% drop between then and 2020 (38,896 in 2010; 35,171 in 2020). In total this is 3,725 in 10 years, whilst the pupil number is growing. The majority are female (75.5%). There has been a gradual decrease in male teachers down 28.2% in 2002 to 24.5% in 2020.
38. Between 2016 (10139,) and 2020 (9550), there was a decline of 589 teachers in the number of registrants with an ability to work through the medium of Welsh and, whilst there does not appear to be a significant decline in the numbers of teachers in STEM subjects between 2017 and 2020, there is a significant disparity between those trained in a science subject but teaching in another subject. This data indicates shortages of teachers in the Welsh medium, which may significantly impede the successful implementation of the Welsh Government strategy for a million Welsh speakers by 2050, and in science subjects because there are insufficient teachers to teach the subjects that they were trained in (EWC (14)).
39. The EWC's ten-year teacher tracking analysis data (18) is also of great concern: Of the 1,424 students awarded Qualified Teacher Status ("QTS") in 2013, 482 were no longer registered in March 2019. In particular an EWC policy briefing in October 2020, highlighted that the EWC's particular recruitment and retention concerns were, a) those relating to new teachers as 85% of NQT's were in fixed contract or supply positions, b) specific subjects at secondary schools (such as science), c) teachers in the Welsh medium and d) headteachers (especially in Welsh medium, secondary, or rural areas). Although this was over two years ago, we believe that these concerns might have even been exacerbated since then.
40. With regard to headteachers, in 2020, there was a significant disparity between the proportion of headteachers aged 45 - 54 and those aged 35 - 44, with the older cohort being larger and appearing proportionately to increase year on year when compared to the younger cohort. Although we would expect a certain number of those looking for headship to become a headteacher after the age of 45, there is also a concern that, when those aged 45 - 54 eventually retire, there will be a shortage of headteachers in Wales, particularly because there are fewer headteachers aged 55+ (19). The number of headteachers has declined by 6.2% in the last five years to 1,386 in 2020. This reflects on an unsupported leader/headteacher pathway and career progression. Whilst pay can be a pull factor in taking on further responsibility we also know that the visible workload and impact on life work balance acts as a barrier for those with the right skills to step forward. The IWPRB 2020 described this as 'to support an effective career pathway for school leaders the level of pay on offer must be sufficient that people stepping up to such a leadership position feel that they are being fairly remunerated for the additional responsibilities and pressures' (20).

41. Pay is an important factor in the retention of the school workforce, but Voice acknowledges that there are other contributory factors. The October EWC policy event (21) named a number of factors as relevant in respect of retention e.g., wellbeing, pay & conditions, competition from England, career structure, professional learning, workload, bureaucracy, accountability, the wider economy - as well as the specifics named above.

42. The Education Support Partnership (“ESP” (23)) is a charity supported by Voice, along with several other education and support staff unions, and is dedicated to improving the health and wellbeing of the entire education workforce.

The ESP Teacher Wellbeing Index 2020 provides stark findings that explain why the retention of teachers in Wales a serious issue (22).

43. The Warwick-Edinburgh scale score is calculated by assimilating responses from a self-administered questionnaire. Respondent teachers in Wales scored 46.4, which is significantly lower than the Welsh Government general population score of 50.9. Further, 27% had experienced mental health issues in the past academic year; 64% had experienced stress from their work and 56%, i.e., more than half of respondents, had considered leaving the education sector in the past two years due to pressures on their health and wellbeing.

44. Although the percentage of respondents across the UK had declined slightly between 2017 and 2020 in stating that their reasons for considering leaving the teaching profession were volume of workload (78% to 63%), seeking a better work/life balance (77% to 64%) and unreasonable demands from managers (58% to 50%), the proportion of respondents giving these reasons is still significant, representing at least half of all respondents in all cases, and is particularly reflected by senior leaders.

45. As a result of these findings, the ESP concludes that retention and stress appear to be closely linked, and that workload remains the most important work-related factor determining wellbeing. In its recommendations, the ESP states that, ‘Overwork has become normalised across education. Healthy working practices and boundaries need to become the new, celebrated norm. With improved levels of health, teachers will be more physically and emotionally present to learners (22) The impact of the pandemic has caused a leap in the number of teachers experiencing stress, from the July survey 62%, to results of an October survey at 84%. This finding in particular points to the urgency of dealing with issues of working conditions for teachers in order to ensure a resilient, stable, secure teaching profession. CEO Sinead McBrearty has described this as ‘staff workload continues to be a serious issue that directly affects the mental health and retention of talented staff’ (ESA (23)).

46. Voice believes that it is essential to tackle workload issues once and for all, and that the accountability culture endemic throughout the whole of the education sector, which creates much of the bureaucratic workload at all levels of the profession has to change. We are heartened by Estyn’s move towards self-evaluation in its inspection regime and by the creation of the Welsh Government’s Reducing Workload and Bureaucracy Working Group (of which Voice is a member), but the

work of the Group has been delayed somewhat in recent weeks. This is due to slow recruitment to the practitioner task and finish groups prevented by current workloads. The Welsh Government and all stakeholders in the education sector have to move quickly to ensure that sufficient teachers are retained in the profession. There is also an imperative to ensure that the implementation of the new curriculum, whenever it happens, does not place unreasonable workload pressures on teachers.

47. Further, Voice is concerned that the coronavirus pandemic has added to the workload of teachers both at the current time and in the future, in attempting to ensure that learners' education is disrupted as little as possible and in determining centre assessed grades for GCSE's, AS Levels, A-Levels and other vocational qualifications. This is a matter that requires close monitoring.
48. The push and pull of comparative pay and working conditions influence teachers' decisions to remain in the profession. Working conditions have a stronger influence, and moderate pay rises do not impact retention (UK Recruitment and Retention (24)) unless targeted to the shortage subjects such as STEM, Welsh Medium, SAN etc. For the veteran teacher intrinsic values such as professional mastery and autonomy are strong motivations for retention. Recruitment and Retention Analysis Report UK have identified workload and lack of support as spoken reasons for leaving (24) findings which mirror the conclusion of the Educational Support Report 2020. What is also important to note is that these are two areas of the education environment which are open to change and improvement. In a particular study of attrition in urban schools, the rate at which teachers left was described as a revolving door (Waddell j, (25) in balancing the push factors this research identified professional learning communities and support from headteachers and leaders as crucial in fostering relationships to build retention (25). Of all professions teaching is one of building relationships. These levers are blocked by named barriers of lack of time and high workloads.
49. A separate survey of teachers, leaders, and governors view of the pay framework identified retention suggestions as protected time (PPA), sabbaticals, research breaks, fully supported CPD. The overall view was that overwork was the key and an appropriate response would be to employ more staff 'they would rather see more teachers employed which would mean a reduction in working hours than an in pay to continue performing the same amount of work. *This would be a greater retention aid than money*, (my italics) (Dawson et al (30)).
50. Reflecting on the fact that 85% of NQTs are in short term or supply contracts begs the question how this resource could be used to advantage by a longer-term allocation to school resources. Evaluation on the effectiveness of cluster models working with supernumerary supply realised significant benefits of an increased capacity in Welsh provision of SAN, the release of staff for school improvements and planning, PPA, CPD, as well covering for long term sickness (Welsh Government Cluster Evaluation (26)). The EWC agrees that professional learning is a key factor in supporting retention. This cluster supernumerary practice not only improved well-being in the school because of the assurance of known and available cover, it supported efficiencies in supply management which was time saving and provided some slack in the system feeding into positive school improvements.

51. Therefore, Voice considers that the main factors required to retain teachers are:

- Fair pay
- Reduced bureaucratic workload
- More support in school
- Transparent and achievable career progression

### **Vacancies, Application Numbers and Future Demand.**

52. There appears to be an upward trend in the number of vacancies for education staff throughout the UK. The UK data from the Office for National Statistics (18) shows an increase in vacancies in education (which very probably also includes support staff in addition to teachers) of 66% between the second quarter of 2001 and the first quarter of 2020, and a 7% increase in vacancies compared with the same quarter in 2019.

53. Jack Worth, NFER, School Workforce Lead (27) commented “our findings suggest that the teacher labour market in Wales has been weakening in recent years, with teacher recruitment and retention trends showing an under-recruitment of trainee teachers, a dwindling pool of applicants and secondary vacancies increasingly going unfilled. These trends raise concerns that a continued decline in teacher numbers could lead to an increasing pupil - teacher ratio, and potentially teacher shortages in the future.” He further describes a substantial and growing challenge of recruitment and retention in secondary schools, shortage subjects (Welsh, maths, science and MFL), in Welsh medium, rural and disadvantaged school. This again mirrors the findings of Luke Sibieta’s report on school funding in Wales.

54. A further indication of a shortage of teachers is the decrease in the number of applicants for teaching posts in all sectors in Wales over time. Ballpark figures show that the numbers of applications for posts in all schools in Wales fell by around 14% (22,597) between 2007 (22,597) and 2019 (19,443), this is even more marked in Welsh medium schools (14). EWC data matches notes that the number of headteachers has declined by 6.2% in the last five years to 1,386 in 2020 (14).

55. The most recent data on the average number of applications per post for headteacher/deputy headteacher shows that positions fell from 18.5 applications in 2014 to 5.6 applications in 2016 (14). This also impacts on the quality of those recruited. Difficulty in recruiting in rural schools has been described by a study into rural retention as ‘staffing with inequitable concentration of inexperienced teachers who are left to labour on their own to reach the needs of students’ (10). The IWPRB 2020 (38) described the position ‘there is strong evidence that the teacher supply situation has continued over the last year.

Pay is clearly not the only cause of these trends in recruitment and retention and the high demands on teachers due to workload and accountability are significant factors, particularly in relation to retention’.

56. Overall, there is reduction in the number of schools in Wales. Increases have been seen in middle schools, and in federated schools, and headteachers covering more than one school. These reduction in numbers and increase in responsibilities mark a looming challenge for the future. This is becoming increasingly significant due to the higher percentage of career deputies unwilling to take up the senior roles ‘to support an effective career pathway for school leaders the level of pay on offer must be sufficient that people stepping up to such leadership positions feel that they are being fairly remunerated for the additional responsibilities and pressures they are taking on’ IWPRB 2020 (37).
57. Stats Wales (28) data also shows a rise in projected pupil numbers over the next five years from 468,000 in 2020 to 471,900 in 2025, thus corresponding with the general rise in the population of Wales. This increase in secondary school pupils is in keeping with other parts of the UK, (the number of pupils in primary schools is expected to decrease).
58. This data confirms Voice’s long held anxiety that pupil increases will have an impact in secondary schools, where teacher recruitment and retention is the most vulnerable. Any reduction in the numbers entering ITE and ongoing teacher attrition will exacerbate this situation. Therefore, in this current climate, teachers’ pay and conditions in Wales will assume even greater significance as the teaching profession competes with more attractive opportunities in the graduate labour market.

## **Matters for recommendation**

### **For implementation from September 2021**

#### **Pay Range Levels from 2021**

59. Voice welcomed the Prime Minister's previous announcement that he intended to raise the starting salary for teachers in England to £30,000 by 2022 and note the change of policy to a proposed 2023/24 implementation with disappointment. We welcomed Welsh Government commitment to 'no detriment' and would ask that this commitment be honoured and be fully covered by either the funding made available by Westminster to the Welsh Government, or then we would expect the Welsh Government to allocate sufficient funds to cover the balance so that the 'no detriment promise' remains. Further, we are clear that this move, and any interim increases to pave the way to this level of salary, must also be reflected in the rest of the pay structure. This will mean significant investment in schools to enable them to implement these changes.
60. Further, we are deeply concerned that the Remit requires the IWPRB to identify the cost of any proposed changes, and we worry about the effect of this requirement on the no detriment promise. Voice believes that costings are essentially affordability by the back door, and that affordability has no place in the deliberations of the IWPRB. The IWPRB should be free to consider in depth the scale of the pay reward that is genuinely needed to value the teaching profession and contribute towards the alleviation of recruitment and retention downward trends.
61. Therefore, in line with last year's evidence submitted and the statement made on behalf of the joint unions, Voice remains convinced that salary increases made since the lifting of the 1% cap have remained insufficient to address the real term losses sustained by teachers over the last ten years. We therefore ask the IWPRB to commit to ensuring that there is no lower pay increase in Wales than in England (or in Scotland or Northern Ireland). We believe that an across the board pay increase of no less than 2.75% in Wales, irrespective of career stage, sector, subject area or location, will ensure that no detriment or fall back occurs.
62. We also believe that it is not enough to have an attractive starting salary if it is not followed by an equally attractive prospect of career progression. Pay differentials need to be maintained in order to retain teachers over the long term because, otherwise, there is a distortion of spine points within the range. Leading on from this, lack of differentiation of pay points may narrow the distinction between the main pay range when compared to other pay ranges used in the profession. Voice has warned before about "frontloading" the pay structure. We agree that teaching needs a competitive and attractive starting salary and attempts in this direction have already been made. However, our more experienced members tell us that recent pay increases have had the negative effect of making them feel forgotten and undervalued, and there is still a recruitment shortage despite last year's higher than proportionate increase in the minima of the main pay range.

We should also note that the most experienced teachers both provide support for NQTs and have a higher learner outcome rate than teachers of fewer years. The

experienced teacher has an impact of 10% more effect on learner outcome. This experience should be harnessed, valued and shared.

63. Any possible future increase in a starting salary to £30,000 cannot be viewed in isolation and must be complemented with differentiated pay points in proportion with the minimum pay point. Therefore, we ask for a uniform pay increase in 2021/22 of a minimum of 2.75% for all pay ranges, irrespective of career stage, sector, subject area or location.

### **Comparison between Experienced Teachers and other Graduate Professions in Wales.**

64. Deferred compensation, which rewards employees for staying in the organisation or professions, and for meeting established performance criteria, is also used in teacher's salary structures. Other elements in employment packages play an important in the attractiveness of the profession, and teaching does not always do this (Egan, D. et al 2019. Cardiff.ac (17)).
65. The Independent Welsh Pay Review Body calculated the mean (mid-range) full-time salary for secondary school teachers in Wales/the UK is £39,279 with secondary school teachers getting salaries similar to chartered accountants, medical radiographers, architects and some professional engineering (civil and mechanical). Primary school teachers have salaries comparable to social workers and midwives.

“Compared to the mean (average) salary across all professional occupations (£36,144). The mean salary of secondary school teachers in Wales is £35,056 and £32,468 for primary school teachers, 3% and 11% lower than that of the mean for all professions respectively.” Wales Online (31).

The OECD has data on salary comparison for teachers and other tertiary occupations. Using full time, full year workers with tertiary education as a benchmark, primary teachers earn 85% of this benchmark salary, lower secondary teachers receive 89% and upper secondary receive 94% (p396). From these data sources there is negative differential of 3% and 6% in comparison of experienced teachers pay and other alternative professions.

### **Roles in Addition to Classroom Teacher**

66. The national pay scales cover the MPS and UPS for classroom teachers, TLRs, lead practitioner roles, leadership group and head teachers. Voice sees these as allowing for a flexible approach to addressing the needs of a school in delivering high-quality education, able to realise on year improvements, and maximising the skills of the workforce. A headteacher has described the flexibility these additionalities offer as ‘TLRs are useful as they allow us to give teachers added responsibility and assess their potential for the leadership using positions without to jump them across onto the points spine (Dawson et al (30)). Allowances are a cost-effective way of addressing priorities without going to additional recruitment’.

67. The various flexibilities allow teachers to develop their own skills through CPD and practice, as well contributing to school improvements. There is a consistent call for clarity on how teachers move from the main to the upper scale. There are also calls on the need for clarity on the distinction between 'roles' or 'tasks' allocated to middle management positions, lead practitioner positions, or TLRs. The feedback is that the awards of the different additionalities reflect favouritism and address retentions needs. The allocation of TLRs are also felt not to reflect the time specified for the task preparation, an unfair acknowledgement particularly disadvantaging the role of SEN, and benefiting the core subjects more than the smaller subjects' areas (30). It is of benefit to keep the flexibilities offered by these roles. A lack of clarity by using discretionary awards contributes to unfairness which can also be implicated in gender discrimination (Pay Framework (32)). Voice recommends an increased clarity and transparency, as these are known factors able to combat this sense of unfairness, supporting a wider application of awards across the characteristics within the teaching profession.

### **Lead Practitioners**

68. As well as spending 60% of their time in the classroom they also lead on developing, implementing and evaluating policies and practice that help school improvement.

This can include coaching and mentoring other teachers, helping teachers experiencing difficulties and curriculum support for teams. In 2019-20 the salary for leading practitioners started at £42,402 and went up to £64,461.

Only 1.0% of teachers (70 individuals) hold this role in Wales. This position could be expanded and afford both a stronger role for experienced teachers, as well leading on school improvements. There have been suggestions of creating a qualification for this position, this would enhance clarity and the distinctiveness of the role and may encourage others to apply.

### **National Scale for TLRs**

69. TLRs holders work is focussed on enhancing teaching and learning. To qualify for a TLR a teacher would need to be 'accountable for a specific and sustained responsibility, that is set out in the schools published staffing structure, needed to ensure continued delivery of high-quality teaching and learning which requires professional skills and judgement. They include an element of leadership in managing and developing a subject or curriculum area, or to lead and manage pupil development across the curriculum. TLR1 includes line management responsibilities.

70. There is a lack of clarity, and clear overlap between the different 'role nominations. Moreover, findings from a survey conducted in England from 2018 on the pay framework (but we would argue also applicable to the situation in Wales),

commissioned by the Department of Education from the Institute for Employment Studies **the governor review of Tr to be put in**, shows that there are widespread difficulties with the way that TLRs are understood and awarded.

71. There is a call for a greater level of clarity in how TLRs are advertised in schools and what is required in terms of additional responsibilities. Concern was raised about the lack of consistency within schools and across different schools in using the allowances. Some teachers reported they are largely left to find out the information for themselves and from each other, in spite of clear school guidelines being available on websites etc. This can lead to misconceptions.
72. As part of the response to the requests for research areas, Voice will suggest that a study of how these roles (LP and TLRs) are carried out in practice with a view to creating a national guidance aiding clarity and parity of implementation across and within schools. In particular the research should ascertain which leadership tasks are included as well as teaching and learning improvement, which areas of education are covered, how many hours extra work are involved, and what level of experience is generally required to be awarded one of these roles, backed up with case and job descriptions examples, will be beneficial to the openness and transparency being called for, also fostering good relations in the school environment.

### **Workload and Management of Time and Tasks split between Directed and Non-directed Time.**

73. All schools in Wales operate according to the School Teachers' Pay and Conditions Document (STPCD) which states that a classroom teacher can only be directed by the headteacher to work for up to a maximum of 1,265 hours over 195 days of the year (this equates to 32.5 hours per 5 days). A maximum of 190 days involve teaching pupils/students, the remainder being non-teaching days where you may be asked to undertake other duties related to your role as a teacher. These are often known as in-service training days (INSET). These limits do not apply if you are paid on the leadership range. This PPA non-directed time is not specified but is described as being open to the style and judgement of the teacher and covers tasks in preparation, marking, feedback and monitoring. Reduced teaching time of an additional 10% is part of induction arrangements, more experienced teachers hold a diversified workload and spend less time teaching.

The lack of clarity on how much non-directed time is appropriate or expected or average makes it more difficult for teachers to challenge a high workload.

74. The OECD 2020 report describes teaching time as a core activity for teachers, but in a large number of countries teachers spend most of their time on activities other than teaching. In 25 countries for lower secondary teachers, 44% of teachers time is spend on teaching on average. Teachers do not have the discretion of whether or not to perform these tasks and they range from PPA, marking and feedback, parent communication are mandatory non-teaching tasks for teachers during their statutory working time (OECD p 415 (4)). These figures are an analysis of how the

actual hours worked are weighted 44% for teacher time teaching.

75. A variety of sources identify workload as a serious stress and retention issue (CooperGobson TES October 2020 (33)) Educational Support (22) name workload as the main reason for teacher's considering leaving the profession. Teachers describe working more than 50 hours a week (TES Hali Hughes October 2020 (33), + Education Support (22) October 2020).
76. Nuffield Foundation and UCL Institute of Education, September 2019 (15) report said teachers work an average of 47 hours a week in term time, eight hours more than teachers in comparable OECD countries. One in four teachers work more than 59 hours a week, while 10% work more than 65 hours per week. Around 40% said they usually work in the evening, and 10% during the weekend.
77. Workload has long been recognised as a retention issue for teachers with many citing this as their main reason for leaving. Whilst this aspect of teachers working days needs further research there are some actions, it is possible to implement immediately which would alleviate some of the pressure and provide the incentives to the more experienced teachers to remain - a feature which is urgently needed in the current pressures brought by the pandemic. Voice strongly recommends increasing the PPA time to 20%.
78. Currently in Wales 47% of vacant positions are filled by supply teachers (Nuffield (15)), and the vast majority of inductees (85% EWC digest) are employed on short term or supply contracts (EWC digest 34). The salary paid for supply by agencies is of concern and is often less than the equivalent permanently employed teacher. Budget pressure could be driving this use of supply.

Voice strongly recommends that this pattern of relying on supply should be abandoned and that permanent positions are planned for all vacancies secured by appropriate funding. Teachers call for more time which is stronger now than ever before, given the increased pressures of the current crisis, the call for more teachers could not be timelier (Dawson et al (29)).

### **Desirability of 'Pay Portability' Allowing Teachers to Retain Pay Levels when Changing Roles and/or Moving Schools**

79. Before 2013, pay portability was a feature of teachers' pay but this was then removed when the new pay system was implemented. However, Voice understands from our members and local authorities that pay portability already happens informally within the majority of local authorities in Wales.

We are strongly in favour of creating a national formal pay portability structure. This would require a standardised approach, with a clear definition of 'pay portability' that would need to be agreed across Wales. However, we consider that this could be a highly beneficial plank of teachers' pay and conditions. Such a structure may contribute to reducing recruitment difficulties in rural areas and certain subjects. This would ensure that equality impact issues, such as the gender pay gap, are

taken into account. If this is not possible in the next academic year, it should be considered for implementation in future years.

### **Summary of Responses Regarding Recommendations for Implementation from September 2021.**

In considering these recommendations we would ask that the IWPRB consider the dedication displayed by the education profession. They have maintained learning throughout the pandemic as well as providing for those children experiencing mental health, at risk or vulnerable, and those children of key workers needed to stay in work to provide care for all of us. Education staff have worked tirelessly, responding to the needs as arisen, volunteering for duties required to provide needed care in a national crisis. The impact of the pandemic demonstrates how much as communities we rely on the education staff. Voice is calling on the IWPRB to implement these recommendations as measures which will promote recruitment and retention of a resilient, stable and secure teaching profession

- We would recommend an across the board pay increase of 2.75%, irrespective of career stage, sector, subject area or location, as this will ensure that at least no detriment or fall back will occur in Wales.
- We would recommend increasing the PPA time allocation from 10% to 20%.
- In response to previous recommendations regarding gender monitoring we would recommend further Equality Impact Assessments are carried on pay policies to assess for equalities impact for gender and other protected characteristics. In particular in relation to the award of TLRs, and the provision of supply teachers.
- We recommend that the current pay differentials are maintained, and no further erosion should take place.
- In terms of research projects Voice suggests two areas of particular relevance in creating improved conditions:
  - a) A research study into the use of lead practitioner roles, and the award of TLRs with a view to creating a national guidance aiding clarity and parity of implementation across and within schools. Exploring i) which leadership tasks and teaching/learning tasks are involved, ii) how many hours extra work are involved, iii) what level of experience is generally required to be awarded one of these roles, iv) and practical examples of the types of projects and job descriptions. This would create an openness and clarity, and foster good relations in the work environment, and address some aspects of career progression.
  - b) A research study exploring long term repercussions of the current policy on supply provision through private agencies i) assessing Equality Impact of the current policy on supply provision through agencies, ii) assessing the impact on the wages, specific roles and duties undertaken, assessing the source and impact on Inductees of the practice in utilising supply (and short term) positions for these inductees introduction into the career of teaching (especially achieving NQT and retention).

## References:

1. Welsh Agenda <https://www.iwa.wales/our-work/themes/the-welsh-agenda-2/?lang=cy>
2. Education Endowment Foundation <https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/evidence-summaries/attainment-gap/>
3. <https://gov.wales/achievement-15-year-olds-program-international-student-assessment-pisa-national-report-2018>
4. <https://oecdecoscope.blog/2020/12/01/turning-hope-into-reality/>
5. Hanushek and Woessman. 2015. The Knowledge Capital of Nations 2015 CESIFO Books.
6. Luke Sibieta 2020. <https://gov.wales/independent-report-provides-depth-analysis-school-funding-system-wales-and-makes-recommendations>
7. <https://www.bankofengland.co.uk/inflation-report/inflation-reports>
8. UNESCO 2012 <https://en.unesco.org/themes/education-sustainable-development>
9. Hanushek et al 2010 <https://hanushek.stanford.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Hanushek%2BWoessmann%202010%20IntEncEduc%202.pdf>
10. Charleen Chiong [https://warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/cte/start-teaching/secondary/interview\\_pre-reading\\_-\\_chiong\\_et\\_al\\_2017\\_berj\\_edited.pdf](https://warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/cte/start-teaching/secondary/interview_pre-reading_-_chiong_et_al_2017_berj_edited.pdf)
11. [https://cdn.obr.uk/The\\_OBRs\\_coronavirus\\_analysis.pdf](https://cdn.obr.uk/The_OBRs_coronavirus_analysis.pdf);
12. <https://luminare.prospects.ac.uk/what-do-graduates-do>
13. [https://graduatemarkettrends.cdn.prismic.io/graduatemarkettrends/1a77ed2a-3431-4954-b8c4-d1ca3982a969\\_what-do-graduates-do-regional-edition-201920.pdf](https://graduatemarkettrends.cdn.prismic.io/graduatemarkettrends/1a77ed2a-3431-4954-b8c4-d1ca3982a969_what-do-graduates-do-regional-edition-201920.pdf)
14. <https://www.ewc.wales/site/index.php/en/statistics-and-research/education-workforce-statistics.html>
15. <https://www.ucl.ac.uk/news/2019/sep/quarter-teachers-england-report-60-hour-working-week>

16. Wales Population 2020: <https://www.ukpopulation.org/wales-population/>
17. Egan et al 2019 Graduate recruitment - teaching and other professions (E).pdf
18. EWC  
[http://www.ewc.wales/site/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=242&Itemid=921&lang=en](http://www.ewc.wales/site/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=242&Itemid=921&lang=en)
19. <https://statswales.gov.wales/Catalogue/Education-and-Skills/Schools-and-Teachers/teachers-and-support-staff/initial-teacher-education/Destinations/studentscompletingittcourses-by-gender-location-employment-qualification-phase>
20. IWPRB 2020
21. <https://www.ewc.wales/site/index.php/en/ewc-news/1481-policy-briefing-teacher-recruitment-and-retention-in-wales.html>
22. [https://www.educationsupport.org.uk/sites/default/files/teacher\\_wellbeing\\_index\\_2019.pdf](https://www.educationsupport.org.uk/sites/default/files/teacher_wellbeing_index_2019.pdf)
23. <https://www.educationsupport.org.uk/resources/research-reports/teacher-wellbeing-index-2020>
24. Teacher Recruitment and Retention in England 2019 CBP-7222.pdf
25. Waddell, J. <http://www.ioci.ecu.edu/index.php/JoCI/article/viewFile/45/80>
26. <https://gov.wales/evaluation-school-based-supply-clusters-follow-report>
27. <https://www.nfer.ac.uk/news-events/press-releases/schools-in-wales-face-increasing-teacher-shortage-challenge/>
28. Hanushek et al 2010  
<https://hanushek.stanford.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Hanushek%2BWoessmann%202010%20IntEncEduc%202.pdf>
29. <https://statswales.gov.wales/Catalogue/Education-and-Skills/Schools-and-Teachers/teachers-and-support-staff/Teacher-Recruitment-and-Retention/teacherrecruitmentposts-by-subject-year/teacherrecruitmentappointments-by-subject-year>
30. Dawson et al 2019 Teachers, Leaders and Governors Views on the pay framework

- [https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/916028/Teachers\\_Pay\\_Framework\\_RR854.pdf](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/916028/Teachers_Pay_Framework_RR854.pdf)
31. <https://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/education/average-teachers-pay-wales-school-18682111>
  32. [https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/757821/Teachers\\_\\_Pay\\_Framework\\_RR854.pdf](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/757821/Teachers__Pay_Framework_RR854.pdf)
  33. <https://www.tes.com/author/haili-hughes>
  34. <https://www.ewc.wales/site/index.php/en/statistics-and-research/education-workforce-statistics.html>
  35. Independent Welsh Pay Review Body: second report 2020
  36. Curry, V.  
<https://curry.virginia.edu/sites/default/files/uploads/epw/Teacher%20Retention%20Policy%20Brief.pdf1>